



COMMISSION MEMORANDUM

TO: Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Commission

FROM: Interim City Manager Rickelle Williams

DATE: June 26, 2024

TITLE: DISCUSS AND TAKE ACTION ON THE ANALYSIS OF POTENTIAL ALTERNATIVE SITE SELECTIONS FOR THE LOCATION OF THE NEW FIRE STATION NO. 1 PROJECT.

RECOMMENDATION

The Administration recommends that the new Fire Station No. 1 project, currently in the construction phase, remain at the currently proposed South Shore Community Center site, as designed and previously approved.

BACKGROUND/HISTORY

On September 13, 2023 the Mayor and City Commission adopted Resolution No. 2023-32775 approving and authorizing the Mayor and City Clerk to execute a Guaranteed Maximum Price (GMP) Amendment No. 2, to the agreement between the City of Miami Beach, Florida and Kaufman Lynn Construction, Inc., for the construction of the Fire Station No.1 Project, the construction of temporary facilities for the Rainbow Intergenerational Learning Center (daycare) currently located at the South Shore Community Center, and the provision of the infrastructure for the future installation of the Apollo mural on the new Fire Station's facade, in the amount of \$24,991,845, plus a five percent owner's contingency in the amount of \$1,249,592, for a total of \$26,241,437; and amending the time to achieve substantial completion from 420 days to 720 days; such amendment subject to and contingent upon an appropriation of funds by the City Commission. The total project budget is \$33,563,588 and is currently in the construction phase.

The project currently proposes to replace the existing Fire Station No. 1, with a new Fire Station at the South Shore Community Center site located at 833 6th Street. This site was selected after the evaluation of multiple sites during the conceptual site planning and feasibility phase because of the size, shape, the access to frontages on the three sides on 6th Street Jefferson Avenue and Meridian Avenue, and its central location which offers the possibility of improved response time towards the south, the Macarthur Causeway and Palm and Hibiscus Islands. The site is the location of public access surface parking lot, P-11. The site provides access to the alley, Meridian Court, through P-11. Construction of the new Fire Station No. 1 facility at this site requires the demolition of the existing South Shore Community Center, and includes the construction of a temporary daycare facility within Flamingo Park.

At the December 13, 2023, meeting of the City Commission, Commissioner Kristen Rosen Gonzalez, sponsored item C7 R and presented to the Commission for its consideration a resolution to stop the contemplated demolition of the Community Center for the purpose of building the new Fire Station No. 1 at that site and, instead, rebuild Fire Station No. 1 at its existing location as a State- of-the Art Facility. During that meeting the Administration indicated that the

size of the property for the existing location of Fire Station No. 1 at 1045 Jefferson Avenue is insufficient (21,000 square feet) to accommodate the program for the new Fire Station No. 1 facility, rendering the proposition to reconstruct on the existing site unfeasible. The City Commission deferred the item and discussion to the next meeting on January 31, 2024, to afford Commissioner Rosen Gonzalez the opportunity to identify alternative locations considering the concern with the size of the site of the existing Fire Station No. 1.

On January 31, 2024, the Mayor and Commission, as part of item R7 E, Save the South Shore Community Center item, further discussed the potential relocation of the Fire Station No. 1 project from the proposed 6th Street site to an alternate location. The Mayor and Commission adopted Resolution No. 2024-32903, after the fact, directing the Administration to pursue two parallel paths for the Fire Station No. 1 Project: (1) continue to execute the current Fire Station No. 1 Project at the South Shore Community Center site and (2) continue to explore alternative sites for the new Fire Station No. 1 Project; and further, directing the Administration to work with Commissioner Bhatt and return to present its findings at the May 15, 2024 Commission meeting to enable the City Commission to have all readily available information to inform its decision as to the option that is in the best interests of the City and its residents.

On February 21, 2024 the Mayor and Commission adopted Resolution No. 2024-32927, submitted by Commissioner Fernandez as item C7 W, directing the City Administration to study the possible relocation of the new Fire Station No. 1 project to a City-owned site located at the western boundary of Flamingo Park at Alton Road between 11th and 12th Streets (Flamingo Park Site), taking into account response times, portability of state grant, time and cost impacts of moving the project to the Flamingo Park site and community input; and further, directing the administration to work with the Office of the City Attorney to determine the requirements for a county-wide voter referendum pursuant to Article 7 of the Miami-Dade County Charter in August 2024 and to prepare the necessary resolutions to proceed with an August referendum should the Commission wish to relocate the project to the Flamingo Park site. As mandated by the Miami-Dade County Charter (Article 7) a county-wide voter referendum will be required prior to locating the Fire Station No. 1 facility within the limits of the park, as this would be considered non-park related use on park land.

Also, during the February 21, 2024 Commission meeting, the Mayor and Commission adopted Resolution No. 2024-32928, as amended from item C7 X, pausing the South Shore Community Center's demolition pending the Administration's thorough analysis and recommendations on the options and viability of alternate sites, to be presented during the Commission meeting on May 15, 2024, and further, confirm neighborhood consensus and approval from the Flamingo Park Neighborhood Association.

On March 13, 2024, the Commission heard item C7 T which proposed suspension of any expenditures towards the Fire Station No. 1 project, until the City Commission receives and evaluates recommendations on the options and viability of other suitable locations for the fire station. During this meeting the Administration confirmed that demolition of the existing facilities at 833 6th Street would not take place until completion of the current analysis on alternative sites, that no mobilization or construction would take place and that ongoing activities were mostly administrative in nature. The item was deferred to the April 3, 2024 Commission meeting, but was not heard.

For the April 3, 2024 City Commission agenda, the Administration prepared an item to discuss and take action on the analysis of potential alternative site selections for the location of the new Fire Station No.1 project, as requested by the City Commission on January 31, 2024. However, the item was not heard.

Also on April 3, 2024, the City Commission adopted Resolution No. 2024-32999 requesting that

Miami-Dade County place a County-wide referendum, on the August 20, 2024 Primary Election ballot, regarding construction of Fire Station No.1 at the western boundary of Flamingo Park, on Alton Road between 11th and 12th Streets.

This discussion item was included on the May 15, 2024 City Commission agenda but was not reached.

On May 21, 2024, the Miami-Dade County Board of County Commissioners adopted Resolution No. R-457-24 approving the inclusion of the County-wide referendum in the August 20, 2024 Primary Election.

ANALYSIS

In the weeks since the January 31, 2024 Commission Meeting, and at the direction of the Commission, the Administration and project team, including the design consultant and construction manager, have commenced a review of potential alternate sites for the Fire Station No. 1 project. The Administration has been working closely with Commissioners Bhatt and Fernandez to identify potential alternate sites:

1. 833 6 Street- (South Shore Community Center) - Current Site
2. Flamingo Park at Alton Road, between 11th and 12th Street (Flamingo Park)
3. 1000 Alton Road (Whole Foods)
4. 1100 5th Street (Pier 1)
5. 960 Alton Road
6. 550 9th Street and 900 Washington Avenue (City owned Surface Parking Lot P-12)
7. 1260 Washington Avenue
8. 429 Lenox Avenue

Identifying and selecting a potential site to house the new Fire Station No. 1 facility is defined by certain parameters which establish requirements as to size, location and physical arrangements. Characteristics which need to be taken into consideration include geographic location and service area, size of lot (3/4 to 1 Acre min.), length and width of lot, adjacent roadway elevations, and ingress/egress paths. Estimated travel times from the proposed location throughout the service area must also be considered. As this is a Category-IV essential facility as identified in the National Building Code, and needs to meet specific finished floor elevation requirements, access to the facility by fire-fighting apparatus is accommodated through ramped driveways. Given the difference of elevation between the adjacent roadways and the required finished floor, the ramps must travel certain lengths which, together with the minimum ground floor dimension of the building, establish the minimum length of any site which might accommodate the facility. The combination of these site selection parameters further limits the availability of potential sites.

As directed by the Commission and following the directive to minimize the redesign of the building, to the extent possible, the project team prepared overlays and reviewed potential site constraints or limitations for each of the identified alternate sites. In order to facilitate a comparison of the various sites, City staff engaged the design consultant and construction manager, and estimated additional costs to date for these services could reach approximately \$60,000. Pursuant to the directive received in January 2024, City staff from the Office of Capital Improvement Projects has dedicated over 500 hours, to the exploration of alternative sites. The analysis has been summarized and a matrix of potential sites with their respective characteristics has been prepared (Exhibit A).

Of the sites identified and reviewed, only the proposed location at 6th Street between Meridian and Jefferson, and three (3) alternate sites, Flamingo Park between 11 and 12 Street, 1000 Alton Road and 1100 5th Street, appear capable of accommodating the Fire Station No. 1 facility with associated ramps and driveways. Parcels owned by private entities will also incur acquisition costs, which for the purposes of this exercise have been estimated using Miami-Dade County Property Appraiser 2023 Market Values. The site analysis generated potential site plans for the

three alternate sites. Regardless of the site selected, all alternatives including the South Shore Community Center, will require amendments to the agreements with both the design consultant and the construction manager.

The sites identified as potential locations are listed in the matrix, and further summarized as follows:

Site 1. South Shore Community Center

This location has been fully designed, is currently in the construction phase and meets all the necessary parameters for site selection for this facility. The property is large enough, measuring approximately 45,000 square feet, and provides sufficient length, approximately 300 feet, to accommodate the facility as well as the necessary ramps (Exhibit B). Furthermore, the length provides the opportunity to include ground floor parking under the building for staff, thereby reducing parking needs in the surrounding community. The use of this site will require the demolition of the existing South Shore Community Center, and the temporary relocation of the Rainbow Intergenerational Learning Center (Daycare) to Flamingo Park, the costs of which are included in the project's overall budget. The temporary Daycare in Flamingo Park, including the dedicated playground, occupies approximately 5,200 SF, or 0.33% of the overall park. The map of estimated travel times has been prepared for this location (Exhibit C), and there are 2,841 residents that live within 500 feet of this location.

Additional costs associated with construction escalation, additional professional services and related fees, as a result of delays to commencement of construction, beyond the current \$33.6 million total project budget, are estimated to be at least \$2 million. The City has committed to finding a location and funding for a permanent Daycare facility, the cost of which is yet to be determined. As of March 31, 2024, approximately \$4 million have already been spent on the project in its current location.

Based on the original project timeline, the new Fire Station No. 1 would have been completed in the spring of 2026. Assuming that direction is provided by May 2024, restart of the project at this location could result in at least 6 months of project delays for a new completion date of fall, 2026.

Site 2. Flamingo Park

This site presents sufficient site length to accommodate the ramps and drive-through functionality, in the north-south direction, with access driveways from 11 Street and 12 Street (Exhibit D). This site provides an opportunity to accommodate parking under the building, for staff, with driveway access to this parking from Alton Road, which will require a driveway permit from the Florida Department of Transportation (FDOT). In order to accommodate the new fire station, the existing running track will need to be shifted eastward approximately 15'. Additionally, the approximately 1700 SF restroom and locker building currently located west of the track, the approximately 800 SF field house located east of the track, and the scoreboard will have to be demolished and reconstructed. The Fire Station in Flamingo Park occupies approximately 40,000 SF or 2.5% of the overall park. In contrast, the temporary Daycare occupies approximately 5,200 SF, or 0.33% of the overall park. See attached Flamingo Park site plan depicting both areas (Exhibit E). The selection of this site will require a county-wide voter referendum, waivers of certain Land Development Regulations and review and approval by the Historic Preservation Board.

City Staff presented this location for Fire Station No. 1 to the Flamingo Park Neighborhood Association on April 1, 2024, which requested renderings showing the facility from different vantage points to better understand the impacts of the facilities on the park. See attached renderings (Exhibit F).

The map of estimated travel times has been prepared for this location (Exhibit G) and there are 2,748 residents that live within 500 feet of this location.

Additional costs associated with construction escalation, additional design and pre-construction services, construction scope, impacts to the track, locker-room building, field house, artificial turf

and drainage, fees and other incidentals are estimated to be approximately \$15-20 million (\$7-9 million for fire station and \$8-10 million for park modifications). Assuming the voter referendum passes in August of 2024, and corresponding direction is provided at that time, relocation of the facility to this site could result in at least 24-30 months of project delays from the original project timeline, for a new completion date of fall 2028, inclusive of park modifications.

Site 3. 1000 Alton Road / 1001 West Avenue / 1025 West Avenue (Whole Foods)

This site is comprised of three individual parcels and a right-of-way and appears to accommodate a drive-through configuration of the facility in an east-west orientation, with ingress/egress drives at Alton Road and West Avenue (Exhibit H). Similar to the Flamingo Park site, this parcel could provide parking under the building, for City staff. This site will require a driveway permit from FDOT, and the vacation and reconfiguration of a portion of the right-of-way (Alton Court Alley). This alternative will require land acquisition of the parcels from private owners, waivers of certain Land Development Regulations and review and approval by the Design Review Board. The map of estimated travel times has been prepared for this location (Exhibit I) and there are 3,938 residents that live within 500 feet of this site.

Additional costs associated with construction escalation, additional design and pre-construction services, construction scope, land acquisition (\$15 million per Miami-Dade County Property Appraiser 2023 Market Value) and other fees are estimated to be approximately \$20-25 million. Development of the Fire Station No. 1 project at this site will take at least 48 months upon completion of land acquisition and assuming the existing buildings are vacated timely. For example, if the land acquisition process is completed in fall of 2024, the project will be completed in fall 2028, resulting in at least a 24-30 month delay from the original project timeline.

Site 4. 1100 5th Street / City Parking Lot P-5 / Right-of-Way (Pier 1)

This site is comprised of several contiguous parcels including the City-owned surface parking lot located at 401 Alton Road (P-5), and a right-of-way which will have to be vacated. Drive-through functionality cannot be accommodated in the north-south direction, does not provide sufficient height to accommodate ground floor parking in the east-west direction, requiring staff to park off-site. However, the project team did identify two potential layouts for the facility (Exhibit J). Both alternatives will require land acquisition of the parcel from a private owner, vacation of right-of-way, waivers of certain Land Development Regulations and review and approval by the Design Review Board. Proximity to 5th Street and Alton Road with associated driveway locations may require FDOT approvals. The map of estimated travel times has been prepared for this location (Exhibit K) and there are 2,535 residents that live within 500 feet of this location.

1. Alternative 1 for this site includes drive-through functionality, ingress/egress from Alton Road and Lenox Avenue, and maintains, albeit reduced, public parking spaces. This layout will require additional grade level space for the maintenance of the trucks and equipment.

2. Alternative 2 for this site is comprised of a single ingress/egress arrangement from Lenox Avenue, eliminating the drive-through functionality, and maintains, albeit reduced, public parking spaces. A level turn-around area allows for vehicles to turn and back into the facility, as well as an area for vehicle and equipment maintenance.

The owner of this property has indicated that they are not interested in selling the property to the City.

Due to the many constraints and challenges at this location, the Administration does not recommend this site as a viable option.

FISCAL IMPACT STATEMENT

N/A

Does this Ordinance require a Business Impact Estimate?

(FOR ORDINANCES ONLY)

The Business Impact Estimate (BIE) was published on . See BIE at:
<https://www.miamibeachfl.gov/city-hall/city-clerk/meeting-notice/>

FINANCIAL INFORMATION

CONCLUSION

All things being equal, and discounting concerns related to time and cost impacts, the Flamingo Park and Whole Foods sites offer viable alternative sites for the Fire Station No. 1 project. However, with no current additional funding sources, and given the condition of the Existing Fire Station No. 1, the Administration continues to recommend that the new Fire Station No. 1 project, currently in the construction phase, remain at the currently proposed South Shore Community Center site, as designed and previously approved. The site analysis and Exhibits have been provided to the Mayor and Commission for consideration of the Fire Station No. 1 project, as directed.

Applicable Area

South Beach

**Is this a "Residents Right to Know" item,
pursuant to City Code Section 2-17?**

Yes

**Is this item related to a G.O. Bond
Project?**

Yes

**Was this Agenda Item initially requested by a lobbyist which, as defined in Code Sec. 2-481,
includes a principal engaged in lobbying?** No

If so, specify the name of lobbyist(s) and principal(s):

Department

Capital Improvement Projects

Sponsor(s)

Commissioner Tanya K. Bhatt

Co-sponsor(s)