

SUBJECT: HPB23-0591, 1500 Collins Av and 1509-1515 Washington Av.

Please provide a narrative response to the comments listed below.

I. DEFICIENCIES IN PRESENTATION

1. All proposed floor plans must clearly indicate the location of all windows.

Response: All proposed floor plans and elevations revised to indicate location of windows.

2. Proposed materials and finishes should be noted on all elevation drawings.

Response: Proposed materials and finishes noted.

3. Provide a sheet with all proposed exterior materials and finishes including color photos of material samples.

Response: Provided; refer to sheet R0-12, exact materials are being sourced and examples will be provided at the public hearing.

4. The permit plans for the previous renovation B1402502 demonstrate that the ceilings of the basement level are above grade. For contributing buildings basements with ceilings above grade count as half of the FAR. For example, if the basement is 1000 sq. ft. then the basement FAR would be 500 sq. ft. Please revise FAR diagrams to include the basement FAR or provide sections drawings demonstrating that the ceiling of the basement is below grade level.

Response: Revised and provided; basement/crawl spaces to be infilled and unused.

5. The proposed FAR drawings must include the columns of all of the exterior terraces at the new tower in order to review for FAR. Only projecting balconies (cantilevered from building wall) are excluded from FAR. Additionally, only covered breezeways, terraces, porches at the ground level are excluded from FAR.

Response: FAR diagrams revised and provided, refer to sheets A0-16 – A0-25; All balconies are cantilevered thus making all columns decorative.

6. Update gross square footage diagrams to include all exterior decks, terraces, balconies etc per the definition: Gross floor area (gross square footage) means the sum of the gross horizontal areas of the floors of a building or buildings, measured from the exterior faces of exterior walls or from the exterior face of an architectural projection, or from the centerline of walls separating two attached buildings, with no exceptions. For the purpose of clarity, gross floor area includes, but is not limited to, stairwells, stairways, covered steps, elevator shafts at every floor (including mezzanine level elevator shafts), mechanical chutes and chases at every floor (including mezzanine level), all levels used for parking and all roof and deck space.

Response: Gross square footage diagrams revised and provided, refer to sheets A0-54 - A0-62.

7. It is not clear what modifications are proposed for the front yards of Haddon Hall and Campton Apartments buildings. Provide line drawing and colored or rendered site plans for each building that fully detail all improvements. NOT ADDRESSED. Must be provided in architectural plans. The architectural and landscaping plans do not match for these areas. Provide details of all paving materials including color photographs of proposed materials. Provide details of fencing at the front property line of the Campton site. The landscaping plans indicate that the porch of Haddon Hall is to be paved in keystone where there is existing terrazzo.

Response: Architectural and Landscape Plans coordinated. Terrazzo to be preserved, refer to sheet L1-01.

8. For the reconstructed facades, provide before and after street raising diagrams and renderings similar to the previous project.

Response: Elevations provided, refer to sheet A3-22, A3-22.A, and A3-22.B. Renders have been provided, refer to sheet R0-05 & R0-06.

9. Provide a rendering from Washington Avenue that clearly demonstrates the relationship of the Campton building, the elevated walkway, the presidential suite and the dining terrace above, both of which appear to be partially above the Campton building.

Response: Provided Detailed sheet, refer to sheets A2-18 - A2-19, as well as render on sheet R0-09, lower middle image.

10. Sheet A0-76, the balconies may only project a maximum of 6'-0" into the 30'-0" front setback and structural columns are not permitted within the 30'-0" front setback.

Response: Noted. Balcony projection will not exceed the maximum permitted by code, refer to sheet A3-36 for further details.

11. Sheet A1-15, no windows are shown in the rooftop addition. The level of detail provided for the proposed rooftop addition at Haddon Hall remains insufficient. Provide detailed elevation drawings indicating where walls are, windows, doors etc. Not all finishes and materials. It appears that the glass extends up over a portion of the roof structure. Is spandrel glass proposed.

Response: Exterior of the rooftop will be a glazed system, note added to sheet A1-15. Additional notes added to sheets A1-16 to A1-19. Additional details added to sheet A1-26. Sample of proposed glass will be an exhibit at the public hearing.

12. Sheet A1-18 etc, if windows are proposed to be replaced, they should be shown in red on the demo elevations and a note should be provided for the new windows.

Response: Revised and provided; windows will be replaced with similar historic design.

13. Sheet A1-20 etc, provide details of the proposed mechanical screening including material and color image of proposed material.

Response: Provided; refer to sheet A3-37, exact materials are being sourced and samples will be provided at the public hearing.

14. Sheet A1-22, provide larger photos of the lobby. The west and east photos are don't match the elevation and the south lobby elevation drawings are mirrored.

Response: Revised and provided; refer to sheets A1-05 – A1-06, and A1-22.

15. Sheet A1-23 diagram must be to scale. Additionally, provide a line-of-sight diagram demonstrating the visibility of the stair and elevator bump out from Collins Avenue.

Response: Diagram has been revised to scale and stair and elevator location provided.

16. Sheet A2-08, dash in the demolition of the wall area for the new arched window openings. The proposed arched window systems should be shown realistically with mullions. It is not clear what is meant by infill and brick finish". Provide photos of proposed materials.

Response: Sheet A2-08 revised and additional notes provided to address comment.

17. Provide details including plan, section and elevation drawings of the elevated walkway structure at the rear of the Campton Apartments above the lobby. NOT ADDRESSED

Response: Provided Detailed sheet, refer to sheets A2-13, A2-15 and A2-20.

18. In addition to the plans provided for the tower building, provide larger scale plans. If necessary, rotate the plans to accommodate larger plans.

Response: Provided enlarged plans; refer to sheets A3-24 – A3-35.

19. All exterior columns for elevated walkways, balconies, terraces etc. must be shown in plan.

Response: Revised and provided on all sheets where applicable.

20. Provide a detail of the proposed glass railings. From the renderings they appear frameless and also incorporate curved glass.

Response: Provided; refer to detail on sheet A3-36.

21. The elevation drawings for the tower portion of the site do not match the renderings.

Response: Renders have been revised to match elevations.

22. Provide details of the proposed backlit terracotta breezeblock including image of proposed breezeblock.

Response: Provided; refer to detail on sheet A3-37.

23. Provide an overall line drawn and colored or rendered site plan. NOT ADDRESSED. Must be included in architectural set and coordinated with landscape set.

Response: Revised and provided on architectural and landscape set.

24. L1-01. Shows keystone paving at the Haddon Hall front porch where there is existing terrazzo.

Response: Revised to show terrazzo preserved.

25. Provide accurate, dimensioned and detailed proposed elevation drawings of the reconstructed facades of 1509-1515. PARTIALLY ADDRESSED. Provide larger reconstruction elevation drawings, if the entire elevations don't fit on one page, split into two pages. Don't provide a cut line.

Response: Provided; refer to sheet A3-22.

26. In general, the proposed elevation drawings of the proposed tower lack detail. Provide larger scale proposed elevation drawings for 1509-1515 and the tower with no shading.

Response: Provided; refer to sheets A3-22.A – A3-22.B.

27. Provide details of all of the projecting balconies, elevated terraces, walkways etc. NOT ADDRESSED.

Response: Refer to additional details provided on sheet A3-36.

II. DESIGN/APPROPRIATENESS COMMENTS (Recommendations)

1. Staff is concerned with the partial demolition of the original ancillary lounge and card room spaces. Staff recommends that these are be retained and restored to the greatest extent possible, given the level of alterations proposed for the building.

Response: Ancillary lounge and card room spaces have been renovated over time. Please see photo below of new automatic sliding doors and walls added. Proposed renovations revert to the original intent of the ancillary public spaces and not the contaminated versions that exist today. Existing historic terrazzo to be preserved and repaired, where needed, in the original location and expanded to work with the new location of walls. The new terrazzo will compliment, but it will be distinct from original.



2. Staff believes it is not important to keep the stair bulkhead remnant at the roof level of the Campton building.

Response: Understood.

3. Staff is not supportive of any storage or restrooms or similar uses along the front of the tower portion of the site in the recreated facades. These spaces should incorporate active use.

Response: Revised, frontages are active uses to the greatest degree possible.

4. Staff recommends that the façade of 1515 Washington Avenue and the upper façade of 1509 Washington Avenue be full and accurately reconstructed and is not supportive of the introduction of terracotta breeze block within the signage band of 1509.

Response: Revised to more accurately reconstruct the shape and materiality of the upper facade. Breeze block removed.